

**From:** [Wilson,Clive](#)  
**To:** [Ridgewell,CB](#); [O'Connor,D](#); [Orson,R](#); [Kelloway,C](#)  
**Cc:** [Metcalf,F](#); [Clark1,B](#); [Graham1,N](#)  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis  
**Date:** 17 June 2019 10:54:28  
**Attachments:** [image002.png](#)  
[image003.png](#)  
[image005.png](#)

---

That's good news, thanks Camilla

Clive

---

**From:** Griffiths,CB  
**Sent:** 17 June 2019 08:49  
**To:** O'Connor,D; Orson,R; Kelloway,C  
**Cc:** Metcalfe,F; Clark1,B; Wilson,Clive; Graham1,N  
**Subject:** Re: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Morning all,

I've just checked the People's Daily and Ruth's name has been taken down.

Many thanks for all your efforts.

Best wishes,  
Camilla

---

**From:** "O'Connor,D" <[D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk](mailto:D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Date:** Friday, 14 June 2019 at 15:05  
**To:** "Orson,R" <[R.Orson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:R.Orson@lse.ac.uk)>, "Griffiths,CB" <[C.B.Griffiths@lse.ac.uk](mailto:C.B.Griffiths@lse.ac.uk)>, "Kelloway,C" <[C.Kelloway@lse.ac.uk](mailto:C.Kelloway@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Cc:** "Metcalf,F" <[F.Metcalf@lse.ac.uk](mailto:F.Metcalf@lse.ac.uk)>, "Clark1,B" <[B.Clark1@lse.ac.uk](mailto:B.Clark1@lse.ac.uk)>, "Wilson,Clive" <[CLIVE.Wilson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:CLIVE.Wilson@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Hi Ruth,

No, sorry, it means the information in the LSE statement (below) is slightly more recent than the info they are using from your email, although it's saying essentially the same thing. I have indicated to them that, therefore, they lose nothing from the story by removing your name/ emails.

They haven't responded to our attempts to get in touch yet.

Best wishes,  
Danny

**LSE spokesperson:**

*"The records of the University of London and London School of Economics and Political Science confirm Tsai Ing-Wen was correctly awarded a PhD in Law in 1984.*

*“Unfortunately, the LSE Library has never held a copy of Tsai Ing-Wen’s thesis. All PhDs from that period were awarded via the University of London and would have been sent first to their Senate House Library.*

*“We have corresponded with the University of London about the thesis and extensive checks have been made. Senate House Library are presently unable to find their copy.”*

/END

### **As background**

I have attached a scan of the relevant entry in the LSE Calendar of 1985/86, which acts an official record of awards and degrees given to LSE students in 1984. This confirms Dr Tsai’s PhD award at the time.

---

**From:** Orson,R  
**Sent:** 14 June 2019 14:48  
**To:** O'Connor,D <D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk>; Griffiths,CB <[C.B.Griffiths@lse.ac.uk](mailto:C.B.Griffiths@lse.ac.uk)>; Kelloway,C <[C.Kelloway@lse.ac.uk](mailto:C.Kelloway@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Cc:** Metcalfe,F <[F.Metcalfe@lse.ac.uk](mailto:F.Metcalfe@lse.ac.uk)>; Clark1,B <[B.Clark1@lse.ac.uk](mailto:B.Clark1@lse.ac.uk)>; Wilson,Clive <[CLIVE.Wilson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:CLIVE.Wilson@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Subject:** Re: Ing-Wen Tsai’s PhD thesis

Thanks Danny,

In regards to the updated LSE statement, what does this say? When you say they ‘can’ use this in replacement of the emails, does this mean that they have agreed to remove the emails and replace it with the LSE text?

Ruth.

Ruth Orson  
Library Assistant, Research Support Services | LSE Research Online  
London School of Economics and Political Science  
10 Portugal Street, London WC2A 2HD  
tel: 020 7955 3528 | email: [R.Orson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:R.Orson@lse.ac.uk)

---

**From:** O'Connor,D  
**Sent:** 14 June 2019 14:12:43  
**To:** Griffiths,CB; Kelloway,C  
**Cc:** Orson,R; Metcalfe,F; Clark1,B; Wilson,Clive  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai’s PhD thesis

Hi all,

Just to keep you updated. We have sent further correspondence to the People’s Daily Taiwan to get

them to remove Ruth's name. We will let you know if we receive a response.

(They have an updated LSE statement which they can use in place of the older screenshotted emails).

Kind regards,

Danny

---

**From:** Griffiths,CB  
**Sent:** 13 June 2019 15:06  
**To:** Kelloway,C <[C.Kelloway@lse.ac.uk](mailto:C.Kelloway@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Cc:** Orson,R <[R.Orson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:R.Orson@lse.ac.uk)>; Metcalfe,F <[F.Metcalfe@lse.ac.uk](mailto:F.Metcalfe@lse.ac.uk)>; Clark1,B <[B.Clark1@lse.ac.uk](mailto:B.Clark1@lse.ac.uk)>; Wilson,Clive <[CLIVE.Wilson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:CLIVE.Wilson@lse.ac.uk)>; O'Connor,D <[D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk](mailto:D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Thanks Charlotte. If you can keep Ruth and I informed on this aspect it would be much appreciated.

All the best,  
Camilla

---

**From:** Kelloway,C  
**Sent:** 13 June 2019 14:45  
**To:** Griffiths,CB  
**Cc:** Orson,R; Metcalfe,F; Clark1,B; Wilson,Clive; O'Connor,D  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Dear Camilla,

We have contacted The People's News and have asked them to remove Ruth's name, explaining that her email was understood to be a personal communication not a press statement for general publication. We have also provided them with a comment from an LSE spokesperson to be used. We will follow up if it is not removed.

Many thanks,  
Charlotte

---

**From:** Griffiths,CB  
**Sent:** 13 June 2019 14:07  
**To:** Kelloway,C  
**Cc:** Orson,R; Metcalfe,F; Clark1,B; Wilson,Clive; O'Connor,D  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis  
**Importance:** High

Dear Charlotte,

I believe the press statement has been released which is good news – however Ruth's name is still appearing on the People's News web page. (<https://www.peoplenews.tw/news/41075ad6-3253->

[4db4-a689-38d8ea3e1e1f](#))

Can you please let Ruth (and I) know where we are in relation to getting it removed? And can this be followed up if they do have not taken it down today?

Thanks,  
Camilla

---

**From:** Kelloway,C  
**Sent:** 12 June 2019 14:05  
**To:** Wilson,Clive  
**Cc:** Griffiths,CB; O'Connor,D; Metcalfe,F  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Hi Clive,

We've adapted the reply to members of the public who are getting in touch. Please see below. Happy for you to send this out in reply to any general enquires, although do let us know if you would prefer this to come from us.

**General response:**

Thank you for your email. We have checked our records and both the London School of Economics and Political Science and the University of London confirm that Tsai Ing-Wen was awarded a PhD in Law 1984.

However, all PhDs from that period were awarded under the University of London banner and would have been sent first to their Senate House Library. We have been in correspondence with the University of London about the thesis and extensive checks have been made. Unfortunately, Senate House are presently unable to find their copy.

Kinds regards,

Below is the response for [REDACTED], we can reply to him as it seems he is sharing information with the media.

**Response for [REDACTED]:**

Thank you for your correspondence, I have been asked to respond with some more information.

Further to your remarks, the records of both the London School of Economics and Political Science and the University of London confirm that Tsai Ing-Wen was awarded a PhD in Law 1984. For your interest, I have attached a scan of a relevant entry in the 'LSE Calendar' of 1985/86, which is an official public record of awards and degrees given to LSE students for the previous year.

The student record shows that the thesis was submitted but the supervisor copy that should have come to LSE Library (the British Library of Political and Economic Science) never did.

As previously circulated, all PhDs from that period were awarded under the University of London banner and would have been sent first to their Senate House Library. They clearly received their copy because otherwise it could not have been catalogued and appear on their catalogue – and from there to the British Library catalogue.

We have been in correspondence with the University of London about the thesis and

extensive checks have been made. Senate House are presently unable to find their copy.

Many thanks,  
Charlotte

---

**From:** Kelloway,C  
**Sent:** 12 June 2019 13:06  
**To:** Wilson,Clive; Ismail,R  
**Cc:** Griffiths,CB; O'Connor,D  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Hi all,

We definitely agree Ruth should be taken out of it and aren't saying we shouldn't ask for her name to be taken down altogether, we're just concerned approaching it from a legal perspective may make the situation worse and make LSE and Ruth a bigger part of the story.

If we could just hold fire on contacting the website until I've had a chance to speak with senior colleagues that would be really helpful.

Many thanks,  
Charlotte

---

**From:** Wilson,Clive  
**Sent:** 12 June 2019 12:36  
**To:** Kelloway,C; Ismail,R  
**Cc:** Griffiths,CB  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Hi Charlotte

sorry, I should have said in my earlier mail but the Library's leadership team had discussed it this morning and although Nicola was happy that Comms are dealing with it, she was also very keen for Ruth to be taken out of this.

thanks

Clive

---

**From:** Kelloway,C  
**Sent:** 12 June 2019 12:29  
**To:** Ismail,R; Wilson,Clive  
**Cc:** Griffiths,CB  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Hi all,

Can I please ask you to hold off on this until I've had a chance to speak to our Head of Press (he should be back in the office in half an hour)?

We have concerns contacting them from a legal perspective could add fuel to the story.

Although I appreciate it is frustrating, what they have reported is factually correct in terms of what was said, so we need to think how we approach it.

Many thanks,  
Charlotte

**Charlotte Kelloway**  
**Media Relations Officer | Communications Division**  
The London School of Economics and Political Science  
Houghton Street, London WC2A 2AE  
t: +44 (0)20 7955 6558  
e: [c.kelloway@lse.ac.uk](mailto:c.kelloway@lse.ac.uk)  
[lse.ac.uk](http://lse.ac.uk)



**LSE is ranked #2 in the world for social science and management.**  
**(QS World University Ranking 2018)**

---

**From:** Ismail,R  
**Sent:** 12 June 2019 12:12  
**To:** Wilson,Clive; Kelloway,C  
**Cc:** Griffiths,CB  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Hi Clive,

I will try and contact them and ask them to remove it as they did not have permission to publicise that statement.

I will keep you updated.

Kind regards,

Refel

---

**From:** Wilson,Clive  
**Sent:** 12 June 2019 12:05  
**To:** Ismail,R; Kelloway,C  
**Cc:** Griffiths,CB  
**Subject:** FW: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Hi Refel

a lot of email over the last 24 hours about the validity of an LSE PhD thesis awarded to Ing-wen Tsai in 1984 – and now president of Taiwan.

One of my colleagues (Ruth Orson) sent out a standard reply to a query explaining that we didn't have a copy of the thesis. This was presumed to be a personal communication but her name has been included in a Taiwanese press report.

<https://www.peoplenews.tw/news/41075ad6-3253-4db4-a689-38d8ea3e1e1f>  
Translation: <https://translate.google.com/translate?hl=en&sl=zh-TW&u=https://www.peoplenews.tw/news/41075ad6-3253-4db4-a689-38d8ea3e1e1f&prev=search>

This is causing a lot of stress for her.

Is there a mechanism to contact them to have it removed?

many thanks

Clive

---

**From:** Griffiths,CB  
**Sent:** 12 June 2019 09:58  
**To:** Orson,R; Kelloway,C; Cerny,MW; O'Connor,D; Wilson,Clive  
**Cc:** Metcalfe,F; Graham1,N; Lsethesesonline  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Dear all,

Further to this, is there any way we can approach the media outlet in Taiwan that currently has Ruth's name on their website to ask that it her name be removed? Are they permitted to make her name known when they have not approached her for permission?

Ruth is getting quite a few emails to her personal email address.

Best wishes,  
Camilla

---

**From:** Orson,R  
**Sent:** 12 June 2019 09:50  
**To:** Kelloway,C; Cerny,MW; O'Connor,D; Wilson,Clive  
**Cc:** Metcalfe,F; Graham1,N; Lsethesesonline; Griffiths,CB  
**Subject:** Re: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Please can my manager Camilla Griffiths be included in any further group emails on this topic.

Ruth.

Ruth Orson  
Library Assistant, Research Support Services | LSE Research Online  
London School of Economics and Political Science  
10 Portugal Street, London WC2A 2HD  
tel: 020 7955 3528 | email: [R.Orson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:R.Orson@lse.ac.uk)

---

**From:** Kelloway,C  
**Sent:** 12 June 2019 09:39:28  
**To:** Cerny,MW; O'Connor,D; Wilson,Clive  
**Cc:** Metcalfe,F; Graham1,N; Orson,R; Lsethesesonline  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Hi all,

Just sharing this news story from the pro Tsai media, citing the British Library's e-theses online service and our news story about Tsai's presidency.

<https://www.taiwannews.com.tw/en/news/3721962>

Many thanks,  
Charlotte

---

**From:** Cerny,MW  
**Sent:** 12 June 2019 07:55  
**To:** O'Connor,D; Wilson,Clive  
**Cc:** Metcalfe,F; Kelloway,C; Graham1,N; Orson,R; Lsethesesonline  
**Subject:** Re: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Thanks for this.

I'm away on training today but will keep an eye on this and any further queries from our end.

Marcus

From: Wilson,Clive  
Sent: Tuesday 11 June, 20:04  
Subject: Re: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis  
To: O'Connor,D  
Cc: Cerny,MW, Metcalfe,F, Kelloway,C, Graham1,N, Orson,R, Lsethesesonline

I've just sent two very polite holding replies although Professor [REDACTED] chasing is bordering



on the rude - although I do appreciate how important the issue is.

Dr Shih is going to come in to see me in the morning at 10. I'll leave a proper reply to the emails until I have spoken to her - but of course happy for anyone to join us.

Clive

**From:** O'Connor,D  
**Sent:** 11 June 2019 19:54  
**To:** Wilson,Clive  
**Cc:** Cerny,MW; Metcalfe,F; Kelloway,C; Graham1,N; Orson,R; Lsethesesonline  
**Subject:** Re: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Thanks for this, Clive. Useful to know.

Ruth do forward on any further letters and we can collate and reply from central LSE accounts

Danny

On 11 Jun 2019, at 17:39, Wilson,Clive <[CLIVE.Wilson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:CLIVE.Wilson@lse.ac.uk)> wrote:

Hi All

just had a chat with Dr Fang-Long Shih in the LSE Taiwan Research Programme who is a supporter of Dr Tsai.

Apparently the Taiwan press and the opposition party are trying to relate this to the incident over Saif gaddafi and the Libyan donation.

Supporters of Dr Tsai are therefore very keen to be able to prove that the degree was awarded correctly/successfully and may be able to get permission from Dr Tsai to release more information from her record as appropriate.

And the Calendar is a public document that anyone from outside LSE can request to view through our archives so there is no DP/GDPR issue.

Clive

**From:** Cerny,MW  
**Sent:** 11 June 2019 17:15  
**To:** O'Connor,D; Metcalfe,F; Kelloway,C; Wilson,Clive; Graham1,N; Orson,R  
**Cc:** Lsethesesonline  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

My opinion is we should leave it in. We should look like we're pretending to have had nothing to do with this and she is an LSE alumnus (we trumpeted as much ourselves when she got elected).

Thanks,  
Marcus

**Marcus Cerny**  
*Deputy Director, PhD Academy*

London School of Economics and Political Science  
Houghton Street  
London WC2A 2AE

**Please consider the environment and do not print this email unless absolutely necessary.**

Please access the attached hyperlink for an important electronic communications disclaimer: <http://lse.ac.uk/emailDisclaimer>

**From:** O'Connor,D  
**Sent:** 11 June 2019 17:09  
**To:** Metcalfe,F; Kelloway,C; Wilson,Clive; Graham1,N; Cerny,MW; Orson,R  
**Cc:** Lsethesesonline  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Thanks. As we're sharing one of LSE's records (the Calendar) I think we should probably leave it in.

(Can switch it around to 'UoL and LSE' though).

D

**From:** Metcalfe,F  
**Sent:** 11 June 2019 17:07  
**To:** Kelloway,C <[C.Kelloway@lse.ac.uk](mailto:C.Kelloway@lse.ac.uk)>; O'Connor,D <[D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk](mailto:D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk)>; Wilson,Clive <[CLIVE.Wilson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:CLIVE.Wilson@lse.ac.uk)>; Graham1,N <[N.Graham1@lse.ac.uk](mailto:N.Graham1@lse.ac.uk)>; Cerny,MW <[M.W.Cerny@lse.ac.uk](mailto:M.W.Cerny@lse.ac.uk)>; Orson,R <[R.Orson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:R.Orson@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Cc:** Lsethesesonline <[Lsethesesonline@lse.ac.uk](mailto:Lsethesesonline@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Subject:** Re: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Looks good to me. You could lose LSE from the first line putting the ownership firmly in UoL court but is that overkill?

Get [Outlook for iOS](#)

**From:** Kelloway,C <[c.kelloway@lse.ac.uk](mailto:c.kelloway@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 11, 2019 4:49 PM  
**To:** O'Connor,D; Wilson,Clive; Graham1,N; Cerny,MW; Orson,R  
**Cc:** Lsethesesonline; Metcalfe,F  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Hi all,

We have put together a reply to [REDACTED] and a media statement for any press requests we get about this. Please find these below.

We can send the reply to [REDACTED] (with the library copied in) as it seems this story is starting to spread into the media from sources such as [REDACTED].

Just one question on the scan of the calendar – does anyone know if sharing this document with external parties will raise any data protection/GDPR issues?

**Letter:**

Dear [REDACTED]

Thank you for your correspondence, I have been asked to respond with some more information.

Further to your remarks, the records of both the London School of Economics and Political Science and the University of London confirm that Tsai Ing-Wen was awarded a PhD in Law 1984. For your interest, I have attached a scan of a relevant entry in the 'LSE Calendar' of 1985/86, which is an official public record of awards and degrees given to LSE students for the previous year.

Unfortunately, the LSE Library has never held a copy of Tsai Ing-wen's thesis. All PhDs from that period were awarded under the University of London banner and would have been sent first to their Senate House Library.

We have been in correspondence with the University of London about the thesis and extensive checks have been made. Senate House are presently unable to find their copy.

[Given these circumstances, it may be worth contacting Dr Tsai's office for detail of the thesis, if she still has a copy]. [optional?]

Kind regards

...

**Media Statement:**

**An LSE spokesperson said:**

"LSE and University of London records confirm Tsai Ing-wen was awarded a PhD in Law in 1984.

"Unfortunately, the LSE Library has never held a copy of Tsai Ing-wen's thesis. All PhDs from that period were awarded via the University of London and would have been sent first to their Senate House Library.

"We have corresponded with the University of London about the thesis and extensive checks have been made. Senate House Library are presently unable to find their copy."

/END

**As background**

I have attached a scan of the relevant entry in the LSE Calendar of 1985/86, which acts an official record of awards and degrees given to LSE students in 1984.

Many thanks,  
Charlotte

**Charlotte Kelloway**  
**Media Relations Officer | Communications Division**  
The London School of Economics and Political Science  
Houghton Street, London WC2A 2AE  
t: +44 (0)20 7955 6558  
e: [c.kelloway@lse.ac.uk](mailto:c.kelloway@lse.ac.uk)  
[lse.ac.uk](http://lse.ac.uk)

<image001.jpg>

[<image002.png>](#)[<image003.png>](#)[<image004.jpg>](#)[<image005.png>](#)[<image006.jpg>](#)

**LSE is ranked #2 in the world for social science and management.  
(QS World University Ranking 2018)**

**From:** O'Connor,D  
**Sent:** 11 June 2019 15:20  
**To:** Wilson,Clive; Graham1,N; Cerny,MW; Orson,R  
**Cc:** Lsethesonline; Metcalfe,F; Kelloway,C  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Thanks for this Clive.

We're just putting together a version of the response for press/ other external parties.

Separately, we will also retrieve a scan of the relevant 1985/86 calendar page. It's not exactly a smoking gun but might be useful if we start getting more hassle for proof.

I'll ask the School Secretary's office in the first instance...as I imagine they have them to hand.

Thanks,

Danny

**From:** Wilson,Clive  
**Sent:** 11 June 2019 15:11  
**To:** Graham1,N <[N.Graham1@lse.ac.uk](mailto:N.Graham1@lse.ac.uk)>; Cerny,MW <[M.W.Cerny@lse.ac.uk](mailto:M.W.Cerny@lse.ac.uk)>; Orson,R <[R.Orson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:R.Orson@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Cc:** O'Connor,D <[D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk](mailto:D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk)>; Lsethesonline <[Lsethesonline@lse.ac.uk](mailto:Lsethesonline@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Hi All

yes, I dealt with this for the Library first time around.

Simeon Underwood who was Academic Registrar at the time had the student record retrieved and stated he was satisfied that the degree was correctly awarded (copied below)

It was also decided that all information relating to supervisor, thesis committee and the oral defense committee, etc could not be released without Dr Tsai's permission.

Nancy's copied our standard reply below, which I have already tweaked slightly to make current. Simeon's instruction also was that anyone pursuing further should be referred to Lorraine. I believe Mark Thomson was also happy with this approach (as he took over directly from Simeon)

happy to try to answer any further questions about what we did if I can.

Clive

Clive Wilson

Enquiry Services Manager (Academic Services)

London School of Economics

10 Portugal Street

London WC2A 2HD

Tel.: 020 7955 7475

Fax.: 020 7955 7454

Email: [Datalibrary@lse.ac.uk](mailto:Datalibrary@lse.ac.uk)

[clive.wilson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:clive.wilson@lse.ac.uk)

From: Underwood,S [<mailto:S.Underwood@lse.ac.uk>]

Sent: 02 July 2015 16:40

To: [REDACTED]

Cc: Foster,NK

Subject: FW: Need to find a 1984 Ph.D. dissertation in your department

[REDACTED]

I believe you are away of the interest in the thesis of Dr Tsai. I think it important that the University and the LSE agrees an approach on who answers questions on what.

There have been five or six requests for copies of the thesis. The interest arises because Dr Tsai is the Democratic Progressive Party's candidate for the Taiwan presidential elections 2016

I have asked my colleagues to retrieve Dr Tsai's file from our archive (although I have seen a scanned version of it, I want to double check by looking at the paper version).

From what I have seen so far, there is no doubt that the degree award is valid. There may be features of the process which reflect the academic habits of the mid-1980s and would be frowned upon today. But we have issued TWIMCs confirming the degree in the past; and on the evidence available to me at present, I see no reason why we shouldn't do so now.

The main mystery is why the copies of the thesis cannot be found. It is clear that people at your end and at the LSE end have looked in all the obvious places and in some which aren't obvious, but cannot find them. My understanding is that the position seems to be that two copies were left with LSE from the supervisor and the internal examiner but that these were never passed on to SHL and that one copy went from Senate House Library to IALS but can no longer be found.

I have also had a message from a Dr Kuo of the Pacific College of Oriental Medicine asking a range of questions about the examination process, as follows:

Dr Tsai's Ph.D. program year:

How many years did Dr Tsai spend in the program:

Dr Tsai's Oral Defense date:

Dr Tsai's Oral Defense Committee Chair and members:

Dr Tsai's Thesis Committee Chair and members:

Dr Tsai's Thesis bonded date:

Dr Tsai's Diploma date and the signing professor or Academic personnel:

I have replied that under UK data protection law I am unable to release the information you have asked for without Dr Tsai's permission.

Whose issue is this ? Given that the issues are around the examination and its aftermath, my instinct is that they come under your jurisdiction rather than ours: which means that if we get further enquiries, we should acknowledge and say that we are passing them over to you. But if you want to disagree with this approach, please say !

Thanks

simeon

**From:** Graham1,N  
**Sent:** 11 June 2019 13:58  
**To:** Cerny,MW; Orson,R  
**Cc:** O'Connor,D; Wilson,Clive; Lsethesonline  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Hi all

My colleague Clive Wilson has sent out some advice on this very issue today. He's drafted the following text for anyone to use if they receive a query. Clive has asked that if you do receive a query and reply, to copy both him and LSE Theses Online in – [lsethesonline@lse.ac.uk](mailto:lsethesonline@lse.ac.uk)

Thank you for expressing an interest in this thesis. Unfortunately, LSE Library has never had a copy of this thesis. All PhDs from that period were awarded under the University of London banner and would have been sent first to Senate House Library. As you can appreciate there has been a lot of interest in Dr Tsai's thesis, we have been in correspondence with the University of London about it and extensive checks have been made. Unfortunately Senate House are unable to find their copy.

I am sorry we cannot help further.

As regards the query from Professor [REDACTED] about the examination and associated records, we assumed that this would rest with the department? I'm just wondering if there's anything within the Research Degrees Unit that officially states that the PhD was submitted and passed? Do your records go back that far?

Nancy

Nancy Graham  
Research Support Manager  
Digital Scholarship and Innovation Group  
LSE Library  
10 Portugal Street  
London  
WC2A 2HD

Tel: +44 (0)20 7955 7946  
Email: [n.graham1@lse.ac.uk](mailto:n.graham1@lse.ac.uk)

Please note my working days are: **Tuesday, Wednesday and Thursday.**

<image007.png>

**From:** Cerny,MW  
**Sent:** 11 June 2019 13:49  
**To:** Orson,R <[R.Orson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:R.Orson@lse.ac.uk)>; Graham1,N <[N.Graham1@lse.ac.uk](mailto:N.Graham1@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Cc:** O'Connor,D <[D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk](mailto:D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Subject:** FW: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Dear Ruth, Nancy and Daniel,

Given that the current query appears to replicate a query we dealt with in 2015 I would assume that we should give the same response that we gave then. The problem is I'm not sure who sent it but the email from the University of London to Dimity in 2015 suggests it will have gone from the Library. Can we check on this?

If so can Daniel advise if the Library should just update and re-send this from the Library for the sake of consistency?

In terms of why the thesis is missing it seems that Senate House acknowledge having one thesis and sending to IALS. This can no longer be found. The theses that were said to be left at the LSE were presumably just never processed and there would not have been felt a need to do this. Examiners copies were sporadically returned to institutions post viva and were probably simply left in an office, either centrally or in the department, unless specifically requested. I would not have expected examiner copies used in the viva to be lodged in a library or retained formally at LSE.

The examination paperwork would have been stored by U of L.

Regards,  
Marcus

**Marcus Cerny**  
*Deputy Director, PhD Academy*  
*London School of Economics and Political Science*  
*Houghton Street*  
*London WC2A 2AE*

**Please consider the environment and do not print this email unless absolutely necessary.**

Please access the attached hyperlink for an important electronic communications disclaimer: <http://lse.ac.uk/emailDisclaimer>

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** 11 June 2019 13:02  
**To:** Cerny,MW  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Dear Marcus

Thank you for your email below. As explained in 2015 we do not have a copy of the PhD thesis in the Senate House Library and so are unable to help. I can confirm that we would have a copy of the thesis at the examination stage however. Please see below:

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** 29 June 2015 15:13  
**To:** Flanagan,D  
**Cc:** Wilson,Clive; Lsethesesonline  
**Subject:** RE: PhD LSE Law Thesis 1984  
**Importance:** High

Dear Dimity,

My colleague has now retrieved the file on this student from our Archive Storage. From this I can see the history of chasing for copies of the thesis both by the Research Degrees Examinations office at Senate House and enquiries from Senate House Library too. In 2011 the SHL confirmed that it sent a copy of the thesis to the Institute for Advanced Legal Studies. At that time, Mrs Janet Allan (Head of Bibliographic Services at SHL established that IALS no longer had a copy of the said thesis.

The Research Degrees Examinations office had also chased both examiners (appointed for the PD examination) and the supervisor (Mr M J Elliott) for the return of the copies of the thesis. Apparently, the Internal Examiner left his copy of the PhD thesis with Mr Elliott post-viva. Mr Elliott left both copies with the LSE asking the LSE to return these to Senate House. These were never received.

The copy referred to above which went over to IALS would have been the spare third copy submitted to the Research Degrees Examinations office for examination on 15 June 1983.

I am sorry I cannot be more helpful.

With best wishes,

[REDACTED]

<image008.png>

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]



<image009.png>

<image010.png>

<image011.png>

<image012.png>

The University of London is an exempt charity and a statutory corporation in England and Wales (Company No. RC000661) HMRC Charities Reference X422. VAT Registration GB 222 7971 03 . We are committed to a 43% cut in CO2 emissions by 2020 against a 2010 baseline. Please consider the environment before printing.

**From:** Cerny,MW <[M.W.Cerny@lse.ac.uk](mailto:M.W.Cerny@lse.ac.uk)>  
**Sent:** 11 June 2019 12:54  
**To:** Lorraine Connor <[Lorraine.Connor@london.ac.uk](mailto:Lorraine.Connor@london.ac.uk)>  
**Subject:** RE: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Dear [REDACTED]

A query has been forwarded to me regarding Ing-Wen Tsai's thesis, awarded in 1984. Having looked into this it appears that you responded to a similar query on this in 2015 on behalf of the University.

Is this still one for you or should I refer this to someone else?

Thanks  
Marcus

**Marcus Cerny**  
*Deputy Director, PhD Academy  
London School of Economics and Political Science  
Houghton Street  
London WC2A 2AE*

**Please consider the environment and do not print this email unless absolutely necessary.**

Please access the attached hyperlink for an important electronic communications disclaimer: <http://lse.ac.uk/emailDisclaimer>

**From:** Orson,R  
**Sent:** 06 June 2019 16:29  
**To:** Phdacademy  
**Subject:** FW: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Hi Shuma,

We have received the query below about Ing-wen Tsai's PhD 1984 thesis.  
<https://ethos.bl.uk/OrderDetails.do?uin=uk.bl.ethos.652034>.

We have had many requests for this thesis since Dr Tsai stood for election. The library has

searched for it extensively and it has been recorded as missing.

The query below seems to be requesting confirmation of whether the thesis existed at all. My manager has asked me to pass this query on to the PhD academy, as you would hold information such as this (and the author's supervisor).

Please could you respond to the request, or pass it on to the relevant person in your department.

Many thanks,

Ruth.

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** 06 June 2019 16:04  
**To:** Lsethesesonline  
**Cc:** Orson,R  
**Subject:** Re: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Dear Ruth:

Very sorry to keep bothering you on the PhD thesis matter. Here are some more questions. You said Tsai's thesis is missing from three separate places, but the libraries there should at least keep some information like the thesis's abstract and its advisor or director who directed Tsai's research. How come such important information is also missing? Or the truth is simply that the thesis has never existed, isn't it? I would greatly appreciate your thoughts on these questions.

Best regards,

[REDACTED]

On Jun 6, 2019, at 5:52 AM, Lsethesesonline <[Lsethesesonline@lse.ac.uk](mailto:Lsethesesonline@lse.ac.uk)> wrote:

Dear [REDACTED]

I am afraid there is no further information we can provide. LSE library, Senate House Library, and Institute of Advanced Legal Studies have searched extensively for this thesis and unfortunately it is missing.

Many thanks,

Ruth.

**Ruth Orson**

Library Assistant, Research Support Services | [LSE Research Online](#)  
London School of Economics and Political Science  
10 Portugal Street, London WC2A 2HD  
tel: 020 7955 3528 | email: [R.Orson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:R.Orson@lse.ac.uk)

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** 05 June 2019 17:36  
**To:** Lsethesesonline; Orson,R  
**Subject:** Re: Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Dear Ruth:

Thank you very much for your information about Ms. Ing-wen Tsai's PhD thesis. Indeed, it is disappointing to me that we cannot find her thesis in each of these three places: LSE library, Senate House Library, and Institute of Advanced Legal Studies. Can you explain why this thesis has just seemed to disappear in the world? For your information, I can easily find other PhD theses in the early 1980s. But why is Tsai's PhD thesis nowhere to see? This is quite unusual, isn't it?

Your further information will be greatly appreciated.

Best regards,

[REDACTED]

On Jun 4, 2019, at 8:05 AM, Lsethesesonline <[Lsethesesonline@lse.ac.uk](mailto:Lsethesesonline@lse.ac.uk)> wrote:

Hello [REDACTED]

Dr Tsai's thesis is unavailable I'm afraid. LSE Library has never had a copy of this thesis.

All PhDs from that period were awarded under the University of London banner and would have been sent first to Senate House Library, and this being under Law would also have gone to the IALS.

Unfortunately Senate House apparently never received a copy and the IALS are unable to find their copy.

We had to make extensive searches when Dr Tsai stood for election and I am sorry to disappoint.

Best wishes,

Ruth.

**Ruth Orson**

Library Assistant, Research Support Services | [LSE Research Online](#)

London School of Economics and Political Science  
10 Portugal Street, London WC2A 2HD  
tel: 020 7955 3528 | email: [R.Orson@lse.ac.uk](mailto:R.Orson@lse.ac.uk)

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** 29 May 2019 22:39  
**To:** Lsethesonline  
**Subject:** Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis

Hello,

I have been looking for a PhD thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai, who was awarded a PhD degree from LSE in 1984. This thesis is titled "Unfair Trade Practices and Safeguard Actions" and interests me as I am an economist in the United States.

I found this thesis's information in the following website:

<https://ethos.bl.uk/OrderDetails.do?uin=uk.bl.ethos.652034>

However, the information about the cited thesis is quite limited. Can you please let me know how I can access the PhD thesis authored by Ing-Wen Tsai?

Thank you very much for your time.

[REDACTED]

