

From: [Cerny MW](#)
To: [Thomson MT](#); [Wilson Clive](#); [Kelloway C](#); [O'Connor D](#); [Metcalf F](#)
Subject: RE: PhD Thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai
Date: 26 June 2019 10:25:00
Attachments: [image002.png](#)
[image003.png](#)
[image005.png](#)
[image008.png](#)

Thanks to everyone for the attention to this. I think the statement is good. Just to note that I've read through the LSE file and it is, very disappointingly given the huge interest in it, an incredibly boring read. Simeon's memory of it is spot on.

Marcus

Marcus Cerny
Deputy Director, PhD Academy
London School of Economics and Political Science
Houghton Street
London WC2A 2AE

Please consider the environment and do not print this email unless absolutely necessary.

Please access the attached hyperlink for an important electronic communications disclaimer: <http://lse.ac.uk/emailDisclaimer>

From: Thomson,MT
Sent: 25 June 2019 19:38
To: Wilson,Clive; Kelloway,C; O'Connor,D; Cerny,MW; Metcalfe,F
Subject: RE: PhD Thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai

Colleagues, greetings

Further to our discussion yesterday, I got in touch with my predecessor – Simeon Underwood – who conducted the review of the file a few years ago that established that the award was made properly.

He had some memory of the case. His review amounted to looking carefully at the archived file. He concluded that all of the paperwork was in order that indicated that the award was made. He didn't have much more to add.

All best,

MTT

From: Wilson,Clive
Sent: 25 June 2019 15:34
To: Kelloway,C <C.Kelloway@lse.ac.uk>; O'Connor,D <D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk>; Cerny,MW <M.W.Cerny@lse.ac.uk>; Thomson,MT <M.T.Thomson@lse.ac.uk>; Metcalfe,F <F.Metcalf@lse.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: PhD Thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai

Thanks Charlotte

looks good to me!

Clive

From: Kelloway,C
Sent: 25 June 2019 14:05
To: O'Connor,D; Cerny,MW; Wilson,Clive; Thomson,MT; Metcalfe,F
Subject: RE: PhD Thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai

Thanks all. I have updated the statement to reflect your comments below:

LSE spokesperson:

"The records of the University of London and London School of Economics and Political Science confirm Tsai Ing-Wen was correctly awarded a PhD in Law in 1984.

"All PhDs from that period were awarded via the University of London and would have been sent first to their Senate House Library. It is clear from Senate House Library records that a copy was received. Senate House have confirmed they sent their copy of the thesis to the Institute for Advanced Legal Studies (IALS).

"We have corresponded with the University of London about the thesis and extensive checks have been made. Neither Senate House nor IALS are able to locate a copy of the thesis."

/END

As background

I have attached a scan of the relevant entry in the LSE Calendar of 1985/86, which acts an official record of awards and degrees given to LSE students in 1984. This confirms Dr Tsai's PhD award at the time.

General response:

Thank you for your email. We have checked our records and both the London School of Economics and Political Science and the University of London confirm that Tsai Ing-Wen was correctly awarded a PhD in Law 1984.

However, all PhDs from that period were awarded via the University of London and would have been sent first to their Senate House Library. It is clear from Senate House Library records that a copy was received. Senate House have confirmed they sent their copy of the thesis to the Institute for Advanced Legal Studies (IALS).

We have corresponded with the University of London about the thesis and extensive checks have been made. Neither Senate House nor IALS are able to locate a copy of the thesis,

Kinds regards,

From: O'Connor,D
Sent: 24 June 2019 17:34
To: Cerny,MW; Kelloway,C; Wilson,Clive; Thomson,MT; Metcalfe,F
Subject: RE: PhD Thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai

Thanks Marcus.

I think that specificity is helpful, and will push people towards UoL.

From: Cerny,MW
Sent: 24 June 2019 17:32
To: O'Connor,D <D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk>; Kelloway,C <C.Kelloway@lse.ac.uk>; Wilson,Clive <CLIVE.Wilson@lse.ac.uk>; Thomson,MT <M.T.Thomson@lse.ac.uk>; Metcalfe,F <F.Metcalfe@lse.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: PhD Thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai

Dear all,

I like the short and simple approach taken. In terms of showing that one existed Lorraine Connor had the following line in her correspondence which I think is helpful in that it shows that Senate House Library had a copy and that they confirmed this. Can we use a version of this?

"In 2011 the SHL confirmed that it sent a copy of the thesis to the Institute for Advanced Legal Studies"

Regards,
Marcus

Marcus Cerny
*Deputy Director, PhD Academy
London School of Economics and Political Science
Houghton Street
London WC2A 2AE*

Please consider the environment and do not print this email unless absolutely necessary.

Please access the attached hyperlink for an important electronic communications disclaimer: <http://lse.ac.uk/emailDisclaimer>

From: O'Connor,D
Sent: 24 June 2019 15:46
To: Kelloway,C; Wilson,Clive; Thomson,MT; Cerny,MW; Metcalfe,F
Subject: RE: PhD Thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai

Shall we maybe just say:

"It is clear from Senate House records that a copy was received."

And leave it at that?

From: Kelloway,C
Sent: 24 June 2019 15:44
To: Wilson,Clive <CLIVE.Wilson@lse.ac.uk>; Thomson,MT <M.T.Thomson@lse.ac.uk>; Cerny,MW <M.W.Cerny@lse.ac.uk>; O'Connor,D <D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk>; Metcalfe,F <F.Metcalfe@lse.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: PhD Thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai

Thanks Clive. Would the below work?

All PhDs from that period were awarded via the University of London and would have been sent first to their Senate House Library. It is clear Senate House received a copy of the thesis as a PhD could not have been awarded without it.

Many thanks,
Charlotte

From: Wilson,Clive
Sent: 24 June 2019 15:35
To: Kelloway,C; Thomson,MT; Cerny,MW; O'Connor,D; Metcalfe,F
Subject: RE: PhD Thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai

Hi Charlotte

sorry, I hate to be awkward. It WAS catalogued, but no longer comes up as a result. I assume they have 'shadowed' the record (Library speak for hiding it).

Not sure how you get around that: 'All PhDs from that period were awarded via the University of London. It is clear from university records that a copy was received as the award could not have been made without it'

?

Clive

From: Kelloway,C
Sent: 24 June 2019 15:17
To: Thomson,MT; Cerny,MW; O'Connor,D; Metcalfe,F
Cc: Wilson,Clive
Subject: RE: PhD Thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai

Hi all,

Following our meeting earlier, we have updated the press statement and general response. This is mainly to shorten the statement and make it clearer. Please find below:

Press response

LSE spokesperson:

"The records of the University of London and London School of Economics and Political Science confirm Tsai Ing-Wen was correctly awarded a PhD in Law in 1984.

"All PhDs from that period were awarded via the University of London and would have been sent first to their Senate House Library. It is clear Senate House received a copy of the thesis as it appears on their catalogue.

"We have corresponded with the University of London about the thesis and extensive checks have been made. Senate House Library are presently unable to find their copy."

/END

As background

I have attached a scan of the relevant entry in the LSE Calendar of 1985/86, which acts an official record of awards and degrees given to LSE students in 1984. This confirms Dr Tsai's PhD award at the time.

General response:

Thank you for your email. We have checked our records and both the London School of Economics and Political Science and the University of London confirm that Tsai Ing-Wen was correctly awarded a PhD in Law 1984.

However, all PhDs from that period were awarded via the University of London and would have been sent first to their Senate House Library. It is clear Senate House received a copy of the thesis as it appears on their catalogue.

We have been in correspondence with the University of London about the thesis and extensive checks have been made. Unfortunately, Senate House are presently unable to find their copy.

Kinds regards,

Many thanks,
Charlotte

Charlotte Kelloway
Media Relations Officer | Communications Division
The London School of Economics and Political Science
Houghton Street, London WC2A 2AE
t: +44 (0)20 7955 6558
e: c.kelloway@lse.ac.uk
lse.ac.uk



[LSE is ranked #2 in the world for social science and management. \(QS World University Ranking 2018\)](#)

From: Thomson,MT
Sent: 24 June 2019 10:06
To: Cerny,MW; O'Connor,D; Metcalfe,F; Kelloway,C
Cc: Wilson,Clive
Subject: RE: PhD Thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai

Also, would it be sensible to involve colleagues in Data Protection and/or the Legal team to this morning's meeting, if part of our discussion is to look at whether we make available further information to enquirers?

From: Cerny,MW
Sent: 24 June 2019 09:48
To: O'Connor,D <D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk>; Metcalfe,F <F.Metcalfe@lse.ac.uk>; Kelloway,C <C.Kelloway@lse.ac.uk>
Cc: Wilson,Clive <CLIVE.Wilson@lse.ac.uk>; Thomson,MT <M.T.Thomson@lse.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: PhD Thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai

This is my correspondent's latest (I have only one on this). According to this the tale may be that it was such a piece of work it is worth two PhDs.

I've copied Mark to check if the registration file is to hand or whether we can retrieve it if not. I'm not interested in reviewing Simeon's considerations but I just want to make sure that I am taking any dates from the official file.

Thanks,
Marcus

Dear Deputy Director Cerny:

I am hereby writing you again trying to supplement my previous email and to simplify the whole matter regarding Dr. Tsai's Ing-wen's Ph.D. thesis. Is it possible that LSE can email Dr. Tsai and ask her to send a copy of her Ph.D. thesis to both LSE Library and the Senate House Library, since neither of the libraries has got a copy of her thesis in the first place?

A reason I am eager to read Dr. Tsai's Ph.D. thesis is that Dr. Tsai was reported to have once claimed that her thesis was so outstanding the LSE was considering to offer her one and a half or even two PhDs. Was it the case?

Thank you very much again.



Marcus Cerny
Deputy Director, PhD Academy
London School of Economics and Political Science
Houghton Street
London WC2A 2AE

[Please consider the environment and do not print this email unless absolutely necessary.](#)
Please access the attached hyperlink for an important electronic communications disclaimer: <http://lse.ac.uk/emailDisclaimer>

From: O'Connor,D
Sent: 23 June 2019 19:53
To: Metcalfe,F; Kelloway,C; Cerny,MW
Cc: Wilson,Clive
Subject: Fwd: PhD Thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai

FYI.

The reply from [REDACTED]

He's gone off the deep end a bit.

Begin forwarded message:

From: [REDACTED]
Date: 21 June 2019 at 21:51:02 BST
To: "O'Connor,D" <D.O'Connor@lse.ac.uk>
Cc: "Wilson,Clive" <CLIVE.Wilson@lse.ac.uk>, R.Orson@lse.ac.uk
Subject: Re: PhD Thesis by Ing-Wen Tsai

Dear Mr. O'Connor:

In this email I raised some more questions regarding your email dated June 14, 2019, 9:08 am, from which you wrote:

"As previously circulated, all PhDs from that period were awarded under the University of London banner and would have been sent first to their Senate House Library. They clearly received their copy because otherwise it would not have been processed and appear on their catalogue – and from there to appear on the British Library catalogue."

In fact, the so-called PhD thesis of Ing-Wen Tsai (1984) does not exist in both physical and digital form. That is the reason why this thesis has not been searchable in each of the three U of London libraries: LSE library, IALS library, and Senate House library. I already made a number of screen shots about my failed search of the PhD thesis just in case a proof is required in the future. I also searched all other PhDs (i.e. 106 other PhDs) in 1983-84, and all those are searchable and existent in their specific locations, except for 5 PhDs. For these missing 5 PhDs, every one has no searchable academic record. For your information, Partha Sen was my professor at the University of Illinois and my long-term friend. As a LSE graduate, he was awarded a PhD in economics in 1984, and his PhD thesis titled "Real balances and the exchange rate: theoretical and empirical analysis" is searchable and existent in LSE Library, as opposed to the case of Ing-Wen Tsai.

It is evidenced that the final copy of Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis has never been received in 1984 by Senate House Library and IALS library. This was confirmed by Ruth Orson (Library Assistant, Research Services, LSE) and Clive Wilson (Enquiry Services Manager, LSE Library) in their emails sent to me. As such, without a final copy of a PhD thesis being received at Senate House Library, how was it possible that Ing-Wen Tsai allegedly earned a PhD in law in 1984?

It is bizarre that Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis becomes searchable in the British Library catalogue using EthOS, an e-theses online service, as well as in the Google Books catalogue. This thesis is unsearchable internally in the U of London libraries (including LSE Library), but it is searchable outside of the U of London. It is bizarre, isn't?

Further, if you examine the following links to EthOS or Google Books, you will see little information about the magic PhD thesis except for the thesis title, author, and the year of 1984. There is no information about the number of pages at all and there is no workable link to the thesis one way or another.

EthOS:
<https://ethos.bl.uk/OrderDetails.do?did=1&uin=uk.bl.ethos.652034>

Google Books:
<https://books.google.com/books?id=IRwIvwEACAAJ&dq=unfair+trade+practices+and+safeguard+actions&hl=en&sa=X&ved=0ahUKEwicioTVnvviAhXLM-AKHRtMBMgQ6AEIKDAA>

Even more bizzare is that the magic thesis was published in 1984 in Ann Arbor, Michigan, the United States according to a famous thesis search engine called ProQuest, as the attached image file indicates. How could it be possible that a PhD thesis completed in 1984 in UK got published right away in the same year in the US?

Is it possible that someone made and uploaded information to the EthOS system, Google Books, and ProQuest in order to cover Ing-Wen Tsai as President of Republic of China (Taiwan)? To me, I cannot preclude this possibility.

Lastly, let me provide some more information about Ing-Wen Tsai. She studied at LSE for less than three years (about 2 years and 6 months; correct me if I am wrong). In such a short-term period, she claimed that she completed a PhD thesis in law in 1984. She then returned to Taiwan for a teaching position in 1984, and with almost no publications, she got promoted to Full Professor within 7 to 8 years. Can we question her integrity as a scholar and as a political leader? I sincerely LSE can be responsible and truthful in dealing with Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis and degree issues.

I contacted you all for a public interest issue under UK FOI, and I am looking forward to your clarifications regarding the true situation of Ing-Wen Tsai's PhD thesis and degree.

Best regards,

[REDACTED]

On Fri, Jun 14, 2019 at 5:21 PM [REDACTED] wrote:

|

