|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 1 | 1. The Role of The British Library in Ing-wen Tsai’s Doctoral Thesis
 |
| 2 | 1.1 The record of Ing-wen Tsai’s doctoral thesis added to EThOS in 2015 |
| 3 | A report based on the records disclosed under the U.K. Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) 2000 |
| 4 | The British Library is the UK national library. E-theses online service, EThOS, is the UK national thesis service holding all UK doctoral theses.EThOS is managed by The British Library. |
| https://www.bl.uk/about-us/our-story/history-of-the-british-library#:~:text=The%20British%20Museum%20Library%2C%20founded,and%20Robert%20and%20Edward%20Harley.https://ethos.bl.uk/About.do |
| 5 | Hwan Lin is an associate professor of Economics at the University of North Carolina, Charlotte. |
| https://belkcollege.charlotte.edu/directory/hwan-c-lin |
| 6 | On June 21, 2019, Lin submitted a FOIA Request to The British Library, investigating a UK doctoral thesis entitled “Unfair trade practices and safeguard actions.” One of his questions was: How this thesis is searchable in the EThOS system if a copy does not exist?  |
| <https://taiwanenews.com/doc/Lin_report_OCT2019_Eng.pdf>10. 190718 Response 1936 |
| 7 | Lin’s FOIA request alleged that the British Library might have added a non-existing doctoral thesis to EThOS. |
| 8 | This is the allegedly non-existing doctoral thesis in EThOS. |
| https://ethos.bl.uk/OrderDetails.do?did=1&uin=uk.bl.ethos.652034 |
| 9 | The author is Ing-wen Tsai, the Republic of China President since 2016. |
| https://english.president.gov.tw/Page/40#:~:text=President%20%26%20vice%20president&text=Born%20in%201956%20in%20Taipei,Pingtung%20County%20in%20southern%20Taiwan |
| 10 | The awarding body is the London School of Economics and political science, LSE. |
| https://ethos.bl.uk/OrderDetails.do?did=1&uin=uk.bl.ethos.652034 |
| 11 | University of London, U.O.L., is a federal university with 17 independent federation members. LSE is one of them. |
| https://www.london.ac.uk/ways-study/study-campus-london/member-institutions |
| 12 | The Date of Award was 1984. |
| https://ethos.bl.uk/OrderDetails.do?did=1&uin=uk.bl.ethos.652034 |
| 13 | The British Library responded on July 18, 2019, disclosing that the British Library did not have the full file of Tsai’s doctoral thesis. |
| <https://taiwanenews.com/doc/Lin_report_OCT2019_Eng.pdf>10. 190718 Response 1936 |
| 14 | Only a record of Tsai’s thesis was added to EThOS in response to a user’s speculative request in June 2015.  |
| <https://taiwanenews.com/doc/Lin_report_OCT2019_Eng.pdf>10. 190718 Response 1936 |
| 15 | In the early 1980s, the degree-awarding body was U.O.L., not LSE. |
| https://www.lse.ac.uk/News/Latest-news-from-LSE/2019/j-October-2019/LSE-statement-on-PhD-of-Dr-Tsai-Ing-wen |
| 16 | In response to a FOIA request, U.O.L provided the 1983-1984 Regulations for Internal Students Proceeding to the Degree of MPhil and Ph.D. |
| 17 | A Ph.D. candidate was required to authorize the British Library to make a microform copy of the doctoral thesis for inter-library loan and the supply of copies. |
| 12.1(C) |
| 18 | An email from the British Library on September 25, 2019, to Clive Wilson, Enquiry Services Manager at the LSE Library, revealed that the British Library did not hold Tsai’s doctoral thesis and had never made a microfilm copy. |
| 2. Emails between LSE and BL(1) |
| 19 | The British Library’s response on July 18, 2019, and the email show that when the record of Tsai’s doctoral thesis was added to EThOS in June 2015, the British Library never had a copy of Tsai’s doctoral thesis.  |
| 20 | More records disclosed under the UK FOIA 2000 are presented in this report. These records show that when Tsai’s doctoral thesis was added to EThOS in June 2015, three libraries of the awarding university could not find the thesis and had never catalogued the thesis. |
| 21 | The first record consists of two emails sent in November 2019.The unique running number allocated by the British Library to Tsai’s thesis was 652034.It was loaded on EThOS on June 24, 2015, along with seven other doctoral theses. |
| [4. Extracted Email Enquiry RE Change of Date.pdf](file:///C%3A%5CUsers%5Cuser1005%5CGoogle%20Drive%5C%E8%94%A1%E8%8B%B1%E6%96%87%E8%AB%96%E6%96%87%5CFOI%5CBritish%20Library%5C1.%20First%20FOI%20Request%5C2.%20%E5%9B%9E%E8%A6%86%5C4.%20Extracted%20Email%20Enquiry%20RE%20Change%20of%20Date.pdf) |
| 22 | WhatDoTheyKnow.com is a site by mySociety designed to help people in the United Kingdom make Freedom of Information requests.On February 23, 2022, U.O.L disclosed five files on the official website of WhatDoTheyKnow.com. |
| https://www.whatdotheyknow.com/request/about\_ico\_commissioners\_decision |
| 23 | The first file is an email chain resulting from the investigations of Tsai’s missing doctoral thesis in 2011 and 2015.The suspicion raised by Lin in 2019 was not new. |
| https://www.whatdotheyknow.com/request/792874/response/1980587/attach/2/Withheld%20information%20A%20Redacted.pdf?cookie\_passthrough=1 |
| 24 | One email revealed that when the record of Tsai’s thesis was added to EThOS on June 24, 2015, the LSE Library initiated an investigation of Tsai’s doctoral thesis on the same day because they had no record of the thesis. |
| Id. |
| 25 | It was an email from someone who managed the LSE Theses Online at the LSE Library on June 24, 2015, at 10:03. |
| Id. |
| 26 | The LSE Theses Online, LSE T.O., is the institutional repository and archive for LSE’s PhD theses. It contains full-text versions of theses accepted for the qualification of Doctorate at LSE. |
| https://info.lse.ac.uk/current-students/phd-academy/assets/documents/LSETO.pdf |
| 27 | The email indicates that the LSE Library also received a request for Tsai’s doctoral thesis in June 2015. |
| https://www.whatdotheyknow.com/request/792874/response/1980587/attach/2/Withheld%20information%20A%20Redacted.pdf?cookie\_passthrough=1 |
| 28 | The thesis was found on the ProQuest Dissertations and Theses Global, uploaded in 2009, twenty-five years after U.O.L. awarded Tsai a PhD in law in 1984. Furthermore, the Publication subject of Tsai’s thesis was not law but Psychology. |
| Id. |
| 29 | The email clearly stated that the LSE Library had no record of Tsai’s doctoral thesis on June 24, 2015.  |
| Id. |
| 30 | The 1983-1984 U.O.L. Regulations required PhD students to deposit their doctoral theses in the University of London Library and in the library of the appropriate School or Institute, if a degree was awarded. |
| 12.1(a) |
| 31 | The University of London Library was renamed the Senate House Library in 2004. |
| https://www.london.ac.uk/senate-house-library/about-us/our-history |
| 32 | Based on the Regulations, Tsai’s final doctoral thesis must be deposited in the Senate House Library. |
| 33 | The Senate House Library responded on June 24, 2015, at 11:19. No record of Tsai’s doctoral thesis was found in the Senate House Library online catalogue. They kept the old card catalogue. There was a card for Tsai’s doctoral thesis, which indicated that the Senate House Library was due to receive Tsai’s doctoral thesis, but the thesis never arrived. |
| https://www.whatdotheyknow.com/request/792874/response/1980587/attach/2/Withheld%20information%20A%20Redacted.pdf?cookie\_passthrough=1 |
| 34 | The email indicates that Tsai’s doctoral thesis had never been deposited, or catalogued by the Senate House Library by June 24, 2015. |
| 35 | U.O.L.’s Institute of Advanced Legal Studies Library (IALS Library) is a repository library for legal texts published in the U.K.  |
| <https://www.london.ac.uk/senate-house-library><https://ials.sas.ac.uk/library> |
| 36 | Tsai’s doctoral thesis is in the field of law, the IALS Library was the library of the appropriate School or Institute in 1984. |
| 12.1(a) |
| 37 | Therefore, Tsai’s final doctoral thesis was also required to be deposited in the IALS Library. |
| 38 | On August 10, 2015, at 12:30, the IALS Library responded:No information about Tsai’s doctoral thesis could be found in the IALS Library. |
| <https://www.whatdotheyknow.com/request/792874/response/1980587/attach/2/Withheld%20information%20A%20Redacted.pdf?cookie_passthrough=1><https://catalogue.libraries.london.ac.uk/search~S6/?searchtype=t&searcharg=unfair+trade+practices+and+safeguard+actions&searchscope=6&SORT=A&Submit.x=41&Submit.y=9> |
| 39 | A unique classmark was assigned to each doctoral thesis deposited in the IALS Library. |
| https://catalogue.libraries.london.ac.uk/search~S6?/vThesis+1/vthesis+1/51%2C279%2C289%2CB/browse |
| 40 | Classmark searches can be done on the IALS Library online catalogue. |
| https://catalogue.libraries.london.ac.uk/search~S6 |
| 41 | A classmark search shows that from Thesis 600 to Thesis 690, spanning from 1982 to 1990, no “classmark” has ever been assigned to Tsai’s doctoral thesis.  |
| <https://catalogue.libraries.london.ac.uk/search~S6?/vThesis+603/vthesis+603/-3,-1,0,B/browse>https://catalogue.libraries.london.ac.uk/search~S6?/vThesis+603/vthesis+603/47,-1,0,B/browse |
| 42 | It indicates that Tsai’s doctoral thesis had never been received, deposited, or catalogued by the IALS Library by June 24, 2015. |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 43 | In 2007, the U.O.L. reorganized. The next year, LSE began awarding degrees. After reorganization, the Senate House Library keeps all LSE doctoral theses in its online catalogue, but the physical theses were withdrawn from the Senate House Library to the LSE Library between 2009 and 2010. |
|  |
| https://www.whatdotheyknow.com/request/792874/response/1980587/attach/2/Withheld%20information%20A%20Redacted.pdf?cookie\_passthrough=1 |
| 44 | In an email to the British Library on June 28, 2019, at 11:10, Clive Wilson admitted that the LSE Library never had a copy of Tsai’s doctoral thesis to begin with. LSE’s defense was that something went wrong when the U.O.L. theses were repatriated. |
| 3. Emails between LSE and BL |
| 45 | The truth is nothing went wrong when the LSE theses were repatriated. On March 21, 2022, Rachel Maguire, Information and Records Manager at LSE, responded to a FOIA request, revealing that Tsai’s doctoral thesis was not repatriated from the Senate House Library, presumably because the Senate House Library never had it. Approximately 600 doctoral theses were identified as being at Senate House Library the LSE did not already have, but “Tsai’s thesis was not identified as such.” |
| [Library Enquiries] When were LSE's PhD theses produced in the 1980s repatriated from the Senate House Library to the LSE Library? Please be precise. |
| 46 | Maguire’s response is consistent with the Senate House Library’s old card catalogue. |
| https://www.whatdotheyknow.com/request/792874/response/1980587/attach/2/Withheld%20information%20A%20Redacted.pdf?cookie\_passthrough=1 |
| 47 | The LSE Library had never received, never catalogued Tsai’s doctoral thesis by June 24, 2015. |
| 48 | Given the evidence presented in this report, when Tsai’s doctoral thesis was added to EThOS on June 24, 2015, U.O.L.’s three libraries, the Senate House Library, the IALS Library, and the LSE Library, had never received Tsai’s doctoral thesis. Only the Senate House Library had a catalogue card indicating that the Senate House Library was due to receive the thesis, but it never arrived. |
| https://www.whatdotheyknow.com/request/792874/response/1980587/attach/2/Withheld%20information%20A%20Redacted.pdf?cookie\_passthrough=1 |
| 49 | The record of Tsai’s doctoral thesis was added to EThOS in response to a speculative request. |
| <https://taiwanenews.com/doc/Lin_report_OCT2019_Eng.pdf>10. 190718 Response 1936 |
| 50 | According to The British Library’s FAQ for EThOS and Theses, when responding to a user’s speculative request for a thesis, The British Library will search for the thesis before it can be added to EThOS. |
| https://www.bl.uk/ethos-and-theses/faq-for-ethos-and-theses |
| 51 | About how to search the thesis, The British Library’s response on July 18, 2019, stated that “when an item is not held, but a request for it is made, the EThOS Admin Team will contact the institution to request a copy for digitization.” |
| <https://taiwanenews.com/doc/Lin_report_OCT2019_Eng.pdf>10. 190718 Response 1936 |
| 52 | That is not how it works for an LSE doctoral thesis to be added to EThOS. |
| 53 | In September 2013, The British Library and LSE signed a Memorandum of Understanding (M.O.U.) relating to the EThOS E-Theses Online Service. |
| 8. Q2. Ethos MOU LSE |
| 54 | Under the M.O.U., to add the record of Tsai’s doctoral thesis to EThOS, the British Library needs to harvest the metadata of Tsai’s doctoral thesis from LSE’s institutional repository, LSE.T.O. |
| Id. |
| 55 | When the metadata cannot be harvested from LSE.T.O., LSE is responsible for making catalogue records available or supplying electronic or paper title pages for cataloguing. The British Library then creates the EThOS record based on the information supplied by LSE.  |
| Id. |
| 56 | The same information can be found on the official website of the British Library under Managing Theses. |
| https://www.bl.uk/ethos-and-theses/managing-theses |
| 57 | We harvest doctoral thesis metadata from all UK institutional repositories and add the harvested data to EThOS.If you have thesis records that are not in your repository, send us a data file from your catalogue in Marc or CSV and we’ll convert the data to add to EThOS.If you have theses for which there is no electronic record at all, please contact us to discuss options for data creation. |
| Id.  |
| 58 | One email sent by EThOS Customer Services on November 20, 2019, confirms that, at least by November 20, 2019, EThOS received doctoral thesis data and metadata from awarding universities. |
| 4. Extracted Email Enquiry RE Change of Date |
| 59 | In response to a FOIA request, on June 5, 2023, the University of Cambridge confirmed that EThOS harvested information about full-text Cambridge PhD thesis records from Cambridge’s institutional repository, Apollo. Only digitized theses from the early 1980s deposited in Apollo would be discoverable in EThOS, where the EThOS record would provide a link to the item in Apollo. Cambridge had sent MARC files of catalogue records to the British Library so a full listing of all Cambridge awarded doctoral theses could be found in EThOS. |
| FOI-2023-374 (Cambridge) Response letter |
| 60 | Furthermore, the LSE Library catalogued a photocopy of Tsai’s personal copy of the thesis in July 2019, but the British Library waited for four months and finally harvested the metadata of Tsai’s personal copy after a digital copy was uploaded to L.S.E.T.O. in October 2019.  |
| 2. Emails between LSE and BL(1) |
| 61 | Under the M.O.U., to add the record of Tsai’s doctoral thesis to EThOS on June 24, 2015, Tsai’s doctoral thesis must be deposited in L.S.E.T.O. first, or the LSE had to supply the catalogue records or the title page of Tsai’s doctoral thesis to the British Library.  |
| 8. Q2. Ethos MOU LSE |
| 62 | However, when the record of Tsai’s doctoral thesis was added to EThOS on June 24, 2015, no metadata of Tsai’s doctoral thesis could be harvested from L.S.E.T.O. |
| 63 | Furthermore, the Senate House Library, the IALS Library, and the LSE Library had no catalogue records and no title page of Tsai’s doctoral thesis to be supplied to the British Library for creating the EThOS record of Tsai’s doctoral thesis. |
| https://www.whatdotheyknow.com/request/792874/response/1980587/attach/2/Withheld%20information%20A%20Redacted.pdf?cookie\_passthrough=1 |
| 64 | The British Library’s response on July 18, 2019, omitted the procedure stipulated in the M.O.U. and said nothing about harvesting metadata from L.S.E.T.O. or acquiring catalogue records and title page from LSE.  |
| <https://taiwanenews.com/doc/Lin_report_OCT2019_Eng.pdf>10. 190718 Response 1936 |
| 65 | Instead, it relied on a “missing from University” note on the EThOS record to imply that the EThOS Admin Team must have contacted LSE to request a copy of Tsai’s thesis for digitization, resulting in the missing note. |
| Id. |
| 66 | The British Library’s response further disclosed that the Admin Team usually verified requests to check they were valid thesis title at the time of the request, but it had no documentary records of what checks were carried out in 2015. |
| Id. |
| 67 | To ensure the theses held in EThOS are final, validated doctoral theses awarded by UK universities, the British Library only works with UK universities rather than with PhD authors direct. |
| https://www.bl.uk/ethos-and-theses/faq-for-ethos-and-theses |
| 68 | LSE and U.O.L. were not the sources of the metadata of Tsai’s doctoral thesis added to EThOS by the British Library on June 24, 2015.  |
| 69 | Who sent the speculative request to the British Library in June 2015?  |
| 70 | Where did the metadata come from? |
| 71 | How did the British Library create the EThOS record of Tsai’s doctoral thesis in June 2015? |
| 72 | Voice generated by TTSMAKERFree Text to SpeechTo be continued |

/End